

BAR MINUTES
CITY OF CHARLOTTESVILLE
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
April 16, 2024 – 5:00 PM
Hybrid Meeting (In person at City Space & virtual via Zoom)



Welcome to this Regular Monthly Meeting of the Charlottesville Board of Architectural Review (BAR). Due to the current public health emergency, this meeting is being held online via Zoom and in person at City Space. The meeting process will be as follows: For each item, staff will make a brief presentation followed by the applicant's presentation, after which members of the public will be allowed to speak. Speakers shall identify themselves and give their current address. Members of the public will have, for each case, up to three minutes to speak. Public comments should be limited to the BAR's jurisdiction; that is, regarding the exterior design of the building and site. Following the BAR's discussion, and before the vote, the applicant shall be allowed up to three minutes to respond, for the purpose of clarification. Thank you for participating.

Members Present: Tyler Whitney, Carl Schwarz, Cheri Lewis, Breck Gastinger, David Timmerman

Staff Present: Patrick Cory, Remy Trail, Jeff Werner

Pre-Meeting:

There is a nursing student class coming to the BAR meeting tonight. There was a discussion regarding the CoA Application from First United Methodist Church. There was a discussion regarding the previous application from the First United Methodist Church.

Staff presented the BAR with a house in a historic conservation district and possible alterations and changes proposed to be made to the house by the owner. There was consensus to allow staff to administratively approve the changes to the house.

The Vice-Chairman called the meeting to order at 5:36 PM.

A. Matters from the public not on the agenda.

No Public Comments

B. Consent Agenda (Note: Any consent agenda item may be pulled and moved to the regular agenda if a BAR member wishes to discuss it, or if any member of the public is present to comment on it. Pulled applications will be discussed at the beginning of the meeting.)

1. Meeting Minutes – March 19, 2024

Mr. Schwarz moved to approve the Consent Agenda – Ms. Lewis with the Second – Motion passes 5-0.

C. Deferred Items

NA

D. New Items

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application

BAR # 24-04-01
101 East Jefferson Street, TMP 330190000
North Downtown ADC District
Owner: First United Methodist Church
Applicant: William L. Owens, AIA
Project: Modify CoA (BAR 22-10-02) to allow standing-seam metal roofing in lieu of asphalt shingles.
(Replacing sections of existing slate roof to accommodate solar panels.)

Jeff Werner, Staff Report – Request CoA to modify CoA approved March 20, 2023, which allows replacing portions of the existing slate roof with asphalt shingles to accommodate the installation of solar panels. The change will allow the solar panels to be clamped onto the standing seams—vs into the asphalt roof-- resulting in no roof penetrations at each mounting point.

William Owens, Applicant – After the CoA was issued, we changed roofers. The roofer made us aware of this new system, which made a lot more sense. Whatever the roofing is, it is not going to be seen. It is going to be under the solar panels. The integrity of the roof was an issue when we started this whole process. We had already committed to salvaging these shingles and replacing them should the solar panels go away at some time.

QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC

No Questions from the Public

QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARD

No Questions from the Board

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC

No Comments from the Public

COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD

Motion to Approve – Ms. Lewis – Having considered the standards set forth within the City Code, including the ADC District Design Guidelines, I move to find allowing a standing-seam metal roof in lieu of asphalt shingles [where existing slate will be removed to accommodate the solar panels] at 101 East Jefferson Street satisfies the BAR’s criteria and is compatible with this property and other properties in the North Downtown ADC District, and that the BAR approves the request. Furthermore, it is understood that this CoA will serve to modify the prior CoA (BAR# 22-10-02) and maintain the four conditions of approval, with the last condition modified as follows:

- If or when the solar panels are removed, where there had been slate roofing the standing seam metal roof will be replaced with either slate or a suitable faux-slate shingle. Second by Mr. Timmerman. Motion passes 5-0.**

Mr. Timmerman had another commitment/meeting and left the meeting.

3. CoA – Preliminary Discussion

218 West Market Street, Tax Parcel 330276000
Downtown ADC District
Owner/Applicant: Heirloom Downtown Mall Development, LLC
Project: New hotel [six stories at West Market St; seven at Old Preston Ave.)

- Staff introduced the proposed project to the BAR for feedback and suggestions from the BAR.

- The applicant is changing the use from residential to hotel use. The project was previously approved for an SUP by the Planning Commission.
- The applicant presented the new proposal for this new future CoA application to be presented at a future BAR meeting. The applicant is aiming for a formal CoA application for the June BAR meeting.
- Mr. Whitney had a question about the outdoor amenity space for the proposed project.
- The amenity space on the 3rd floor will be for the guests at the hotel. The amount of amenity space will far exceed the amount of public amenity space that is required.
- There was discussion and feedback surrounding the streetscape and the street trees on the site.
- Mr. Gastinger did find it difficult to review without the surrounding and existing buildings context.
- Ms. Lewis reminded the applicant that the purview of the BAR is only on the exterior appearance of the building and not on the interior programming.
- Ms. Lewis did remind the applicant of the associated conditions of the SUP approval by the Planning Commission in 2019.
- Mr. Schwarz did bring up that the guidelines recommend durable and long-lasting materials, especially near the ground.
- The walk through from Old Preston and Market Street is much easier if it is a hotel versus a residential building according to the applicant.
- Mr. Gastinger did ask the applicant to review the guidelines for guidance on verticality and the context.
- Mr. Gastinger did ask the applicant about the parking and the potential of the building sitting on top of 2 stories of parking. The applicant did respond that the parking on the first story will be concealed. The rest of the building will be pulled back.
- Ms. Lewis did recommend that the applicant reach out to the other members of the BAR not present for the preliminary discussion.
- Several members of the BAR brought up the prominence of the site and will be visible from multiple points.
- The applicant did express a desire to bring something to the BAR in May when there are more members of the BAR to provide feedback in another preliminary discussion.

E. Other Business

4. Staff Questions/Discussion

- Design Guidelines – Continue Discussion

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 6:46 PM.